

1980

Review of *Die ostgriechischen Grabreliefs II*, by Ernst Pfuhl and Hans Möbius

Brunilde S. Ridgway
Bryn Mawr College, bridgway@brynmawr.edu

[Let us know how access to this document benefits you.](#)

Follow this and additional works at: http://repository.brynmawr.edu/arch_pubs

 Part of the [Classical Archaeology and Art History Commons](#), and the [History of Art, Architecture, and Archaeology Commons](#)

Custom Citation

Ridgway, Brunilde S. 1980. Review of *Die ostgriechischen Grabreliefs II*, by Ernst Pfuhl and Hans Möbius. *American Journal of Archaeology* 84:543-544.

This paper is posted at Scholarship, Research, and Creative Work at Bryn Mawr College. http://repository.brynmawr.edu/arch_pubs/30

For more information, please contact repository@brynmawr.edu.

scenes of lovemaking and the Return of Hephaistos (pl. 72), and a hydria of the Leagros Group representing Achilles dragging the body of Hektor (pl. 82). The most significant cups include a variant of the type A, decorated by the Amasis Painter with an eye-siren and a pair of plump masturbating revellers, a masterpiece of drawing and humor (pls. 100, 5; 101), and a magnificent eye-cup of the Krokotos Group, adorned with masks of Dionysos peering out from vine bowers (pl. 102). Among the other shapes, there is an exquisite dinos complete with stand (pls. 65, 2-4; 66). Around the interior of the rim, four sailing ships ply through water, which would have merged with wine when the vessel was full.

Many of the vases in this fascicule appear in Beazley's lists in *ABV* and *Paralipomena*. In addition eleven other pieces are here assigned to painters or groups by various scholars. These include a hydria attributed to the Taleides Painter by Mary B. Moore and Dietrich von Bothmer (pl. 73), an especially fine fragmentary hydria recognized as a work of the Rycroft Painter by Moore (pls. 83; 85, 1), and a lip-cup attributed by Martin Robertson to the Oakeshott Painter (pl. 90, 1-2). The loutrophoros-hydria on pl. 67, assigned to the Polos Painter by Herbert Hoffmann, does not seem to be by his hand. Contrast, for example, the hydria no. 76.34 (pls. 68; 69, 1), which is surely a work of this Painter. Although more than half of the vases here presented have already been attributed, the fascicule still offers a rich field for stylistic investigation. And for those scholars interested in iconography, the subject matter of the vases will indeed prove a treasure trove.

CVA Boston 2 exhibits the same high standards that have characterized all of the recent American fascicules. The material is precisely and fully described and documented in a text almost completely free of printing errors. The plates are laid out in a logical and aesthetically pleasing arrangement. And the cost of the fascicule, \$40.00, is modest by today's standards. The plates display some shortcomings, but their quality is in general very high. Some of the illustrations, such as those on pls. 74; 76, 1; and 108, 12-15, are too dark; and the photographs on pls. 107, 2, and 109, 16, are out of focus. One would wish for details of several of the vases, in particular the hydria by "Elbows Out" (pl. 72), the predellae of the hydriai on pls. 75-78 and the kalpis on pl. 85, 2-3.

Some supplements to the text may prove useful. Pls. 65, 2; 66: to the bibliography, add Hector Williams, in Warren G. Moon, *Greek Vase-painting in Midwestern Collections* (The Art Institute of Chicago 1979) p. 62 (hereafter *Midwestern Collections*). For no. 8 in D. von Bothmer's list of dinoi with ships on the inside of the rim, Chicago, University, see Williams, in *Midwestern Collections* pp. 62-63, no. 37; its inventory number is 1967.115.141. For no. 13, Cleveland 71.46, see Barbara A. Kathman, in *Midwestern Collections* pp. 110-11, no. 63, and the reference there cited. Pl.

72: the inconsistent use of the words "satyr" and "silen" for the same creatures is disturbing. Pl. 75: the description of the predella is confusing. One wonders whether a vase with so much overpainting deserves publication. Pl. 78: to the bibliography on the hydria Toledo 1950.261, add Kurt T. Luckner, in *Midwestern Collections* pp. 80-81, no. 48. Pl. 81: for the subject matter of both the shoulder and body panels, compare a hydria in the Kanellopoulos Collection, Athens, attributed by Maria Brouskari to the Antimenes Painter (*AAA* 9 [1976] cover and p. 148). To the bibliography on the hydria Toledo 1961.23, add Kurt T. Luckner, in *Midwestern Collections* pp. 118-19, no. 67, and color plate III. Pl. 82: under the description of accessory colors, for "chlamys" of Kyknos' charioteer, read "chiton." Pl. 87: the mock inscription over the river-god Acheloos should have been mentioned. To the bibliography, add *Kunstwerke der Antike, Auktion* 56, 19. Februar 1980, Münzen und Medaillen AG Basel p. 28, under no. 64. Pls. 97, 6; 98, 1-2: for the subject, compare also the band-cup Columbia, University of Missouri 69.111, attributed by William Biers to the Centaur Painter (*Midwestern Collections* pp. 76-77, no. 46). Pl. 102: to the bibliography, add E.E. Bell, "Two Krokotos Mask Cups at San Simeon," *CSCA* 10 (1977) pp. 4, 7, and 13, n. 21. Pl. 10, 1: the date of ca. 510-500 proposed for this cup seems too late; the reviewer would prefer a date of ca. 530-520. The Boston kylix has been attributed to the Krokotos Painter by A.D. Ure ("Krokotos and White Heron," *JHS* 75 [1955] 97, no. 10). Pl. 105: the dimensions given are incomplete. Pl. 109, 3-4: to the bibliography on Leyden 1954.2.2, add *CVA* Leyden 1, pls. 19, 1-2; 20, 1-2. Pl. 109, 17: is not the youth moving to right, with his head averted?

With its well documented text and rich illustrative material, *CVA* Boston 2 offers those interested in Attic vase-painting an invaluable tool for study and a source of intellectual and visual pleasure. One hopes that the promised fascicule 3, which will complete the publication of the Attic black-figure material, will soon appear.

EVELYN E. BELL

DEPARTMENT OF ART HISTORY
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA

DIE OSTGRIECHISCHEN GRABRELIEFS II, by *Ernst Pfuhl* and *Hans Möbius*. Text vol., pp. 334 (xxv-xxix + 279-612), figs. 59 (figs. 73-130); plates vol., pp. xix-xxviii, pls. 170-332. Deutsches Archäologisches Institut. Philipp von Zabern, Mainz, 1979.

A previous issue of *AJA* (82 [1978] 414-15) detailed the troubled history of this Corpus of East Greek grave reliefs when the first two volumes (one of text and one of plates) appeared. History repeats

itself: as Pfuhl had died just after completing the main text, so now Möbius died after putting the final touches to his manuscript, but before he could see in print the fruits of his thirty years of labor on Pfuhl's initial version. As Pfuhl's photograph prefaced the contents of Vol. I, so now appropriately Möbius' portrait begins Vol. II, and a short preface by W. Krämer, dated December 1978, updates the vicissitudes of this *magnum opus*.

This second set of volumes follows the first in all respects: pages, figures and plates are numbered consecutively and the entries begin with no. 1128 (up to no. 2323). The format is the same: each typological grouping is preceded by extensive general comments and the entries are limited to description, with a minimum of interpretation. Different scenes on the same stele are discussed under various headings, so that complete knowledge of certain pieces can be acquired only by consulting three or more entries. Extensive indices follow the catalogue proper: findspots, present location, general topics, inscriptions—these last subdivided according to names: personal, geographical, of gods, heroes, sculptors, even dogs—and there are concordances to the inscriptions and to other major publications of gravestones. Nonetheless I still find it difficult to go from plate to text; one more concordance (between illustrations and entries) would have been helpful.

The typological groupings begin with Occupations (nos. 1128-95), which include hunters, fishers, drivers and shoemakers as well as schoolmaster, actor and even lion-tamer. Most of these stelai belong to the Roman period. So do all of those in the second group, Gladiators; however, these intriguing reliefs, often appearing on piers or bases, are not all surely funerary. The same ambiguity exists for many other types, where lines between hero cult and funerary intent are difficult to draw. The third category, Fighting Warriors, hardly reflects the turmoil of the Hellenistic wars, but the stele of Menas (no. 1269) with its long epitaph and its unusually apposite representation can be dated precisely to the Battle of Kouroupedion, 281 B.C.

The Riders (nos. 1279-469) comprise some of the best monuments; the iconography of the mounted or dismounted man and his horse, with or without grooms and subsidiary figures, but often with tree, snake and altar, occurs also in non-funerary contexts (e.g., a metope from the theater at Thasos, amidst depictions of other gods) and is part of a long tradition. Boar and dog often allude to the hunt, but a rich religious symbolism underlies other elements. Sometimes the riders are paired; three stelai show a riding lady, one straddling her mount like a man, and are difficult to explain. A few pieces, because of their provenience (e.g., no. 1366, from the Demeter sanctuary in Pergamon) must be votive, and some inscriptions carry the name of the rider in the dative, as for a dedication. A fragmentary stele of the 2nd c. B.C. from

Smyrna (no. 1450) depicts a man and his horse next to a statuette standing on a high pedestal and holding a theatrical mask, perhaps an allusion to the cult of the Muses and the musical competitions centering on Hellenistic burials.

Some of the elements common to Riders' stelai occur also in the next two categories: Libation and Offering, and Banquet. This latter is perhaps the largest of the groupings (nos. 1488-2066) and allows several subdivisions, including some for which the absence of the dish-laden table precludes the traditional identification as a funerary meal (nos. 2034-39). Among them, note the 2nd c. B.C. naiskoi with archaic karyatids supporting the entablature with one raised hand. Since several publications have dealt with the *Totenmahl* in recent years, Pfuhl's original comments have been considerably shortened, but a useful discussion of the various elements has been retained, together with helpful chronological hints. One stele, no. 1868, belongs still to the end of the 4th c. B.C. and seems transitional between Attic votive reliefs of the Classical period and Hellenistic Ionic gravestones.

Other categories are less rich: Prothesis, Cilician rock-reliefs; Gods and Symbolic Figures; Protomes and Busts (a long-lived local tradition beginning in the Late Hellenistic period but independent from the late Republican-early Imperial Roman tombstones); Animals and Plants (including animals' graves, as well as animals represented on men's gravestones, especially the intriguing snakes); Cursing Hands; Gorgoneia and other Apotropaia; Objects; and Fragments. An Appendix discusses 23 monuments with either painted or engraved scenes—among them the famous Chian stelai with their distinctive technique. Some painted stelai have retained only the faintest traces of their original decoration; P.M. Fraser (*Rhodian Funerary Monuments* [Oxford 1977] 9-10 and n. 37) wonders whether in fact these were plain monuments, but the doubt seems unnecessary.

Although this treatment of the various monuments may tend to obscure regional preferences in favor of a broad encompassing of East Greek art, one of the great contributions of this Corpus is the excellent sequence of plates illustrating monument after monument within the same typology, so that variations and combinations become meaningfully apparent. Occasional additions and subtractions will take place in the future, but Pfuhl/Möbius is bound to remain the authority on East Greek gravestones for many years to come.

BRUNILDE SISMONDO RIDGWAY

DEPARTMENT OF CLASSICAL
AND NEAR EASTERN ARCHAEOLOGY
BRYN MAWR COLLEGE
BRYN MAWR, PENNSYLVANIA 19010

ITALY BEFORE THE ROMANS, edited by *David and Francesca Ridgway*. Pp. xxxi + 511, maps 10,