

1999

*Review of Gentlemen, Bourgeois, and Revolutionaries:
Political Change and Cultural Persistence among the
Spanish Dominant Groups 1750-1850*, by Jesus Cruz

Gary W. McDonogh
Bryn Mawr College, gmcdonog@brynmawr.edu

[Let us know how access to this document benefits you.](#)

Follow this and additional works at: http://repository.brynmawr.edu/cities_pubs

 Part of the [Architecture Commons](#), [History of Art, Architecture, and Archaeology Commons](#),
and the [Urban Studies and Planning Commons](#)

Custom Citation

McDonogh, Gary W. *Review of Gentlemen, Bourgeois, and Revolutionaries: Political Change and Cultural Persistence among the Spanish Dominant Groups 1750-1850*, by Jesus Cruz. *American Historical Review* 104 (1999): 1015-1016, doi: 10.2307/2651154.

This paper is posted at Scholarship, Research, and Creative Work at Bryn Mawr College. http://repository.brynmawr.edu/cities_pubs/8

For more information, please contact repository@brynmawr.edu.

in several respects. Cádiz was a locus of mobility, both social and geographical, and marriage into local families was an important means of achieving or consolidating individual success. One relatively stable pattern of integration found established families recruiting sons-in-law from the ranks of newcomers to the city. These *yernos* were then drawn into managing roles in the family business and often into residing within the bride's household. Dowries were frequently invested back into the firm, thus mitigating the threat to the accumulation of capital posed by Castile's partible inheritance laws. (Other devices to the same end included dispatching unmarried daughters to local convents, instituting chaplaincies and other bequests favorable to members of the kin group, and using what testamentary leeway one could indirectly to favor single heirs. Formal entails, however, appear to have been created only rarely, which doubtless reflected a strong reluctance to immobilize capital needed for long-distance trade.) Many of these cheaply acquired husbands left for the New World shortly after their weddings, although the intensification of colonial trade during the second half of the century encouraged a growing number of men to marry at a later age, following rather than immediately preceding their terms as factors and agents overseas. According to Fernández, one product of these high levels of mobility and periodic male out-migration was that elite women, especially when widowed, were able to play prominent roles in family firms. They also increasingly participated in an emerging "public sphere" of sociability and cultural consumption. Another, less visible result was the younger generation's slow disengagement in the final years of the century from the patriarchal, corporate family ethos of the past, as both male and female members of the elite drifted toward modern individualism and meritocracy.

This book is clearly structured, well written, and thoroughly researched. Most of its evidence derives from notarial documents, especially testaments. The author has mined the latter for many revealing details, which she presents by scattering individual case studies throughout the text. Despite the obvious striving for synthesis, the sheer abundance of information is at times overwhelming. This is perhaps an inevitable compensation for how little is known of the particulars of the social history of early modern Spanish cities. One nevertheless regrets that the weight of detail, along with the study's relentless focus on the single theme of the changing organization of elite family life, have consigned other interesting issues—especially the transition from patriarchy to individualism and the emergence of a sociopolitical public sphere—more to the realm of allusion than to exploration in depth. These are minor problems, however, and ones that further efforts will surely dispose of. That there is much more interesting work to be done is amply borne out by the findings of this solid and engaging study, which deserves to be read by all those interested in the

links between economic change and family structures in a Spanish urban setting.

JAMES S. AMELANG
*Autonomous University,
Madrid*

JESUS CRUZ. *Gentlemen, Bourgeois, and Revolutionaries: Political Change and Cultural Persistence among the Spanish Dominant Groups 1750–1850*. New York: Cambridge University Press. 1996. Pp. x, 350. \$59.95.

This collective biographical analysis of the men of wealth and power who controlled Madrid during the crucial political transitions of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries engages both general debates about European development and specific concerns of Spanish historiography. Jesus Cruz discusses these theoretical issues at some length, including ample reflection on the development of schools of historical interpretations within Spain. The text focuses, however, on the analysis of archival data concerning the investments and practices of merchants, bankers, professionals, bureaucrats, and politicians and their families across several generations. In a series of detailed chapters (supported by additional data appendixes) that will contribute to many other scholarly analyses, Cruz explores origins, investments, and the diversification of economic and social capital, sector by sector. He also follows these men and families across various constitutive networks in the transformation of the city and state. The author, moreover, consistently balances quantitative summaries with more detailed portraits of individual figures and families. Thus, he clarifies pivotal issues of recruitment, social relations, and the intersections of economic and social mobility as these new figures became integrated with each other and with older men of power.

Through this meticulous analysis, Cruz shows how the families who participated in the shift from aristocratic rule to bourgeois politics followed established patterns of geographic and social mobility that served to integrate elites rather than overthrowing older values and families. Hence, he reconsiders one of the longstanding dilemmas of Spanish development (especially in the capital): how this transition took place without a change in economic structures (industrialization) except in the periphery, especially Catalonia. Yet, at the same time, it is clear that these families nonetheless brought new knowledge and experience to forces that had already begun to reshape Spain.

The volume does have some frustrating limits. Although Cruz carefully reads and integrates studies of earlier elites, one wishes that he had incorporated them more completely into his model of evolution rather than revolution, especially insofar as we might understand their perceptions of newcomers and their own continuing roles. Cruz's very definition of the sectors of power which constituted the new elite, for example, omits the older nobility, the Catholic Church, and the military. Their perceptions and actions would

certainly amplify our understanding of power and change even as we note the recurrence of patterns of upward mobility.

One might also wish for more comparison within Spain. Cruz tends to treat Madrid and Spain interchangeably as loci for the elite, although he illuminates the flow from Northern Spain (Santander and Euzkadi) that played an important role in the emergence of this new group. Yet there were other models of development emerging in the South and in Catalonia that would add nuance to a rather teleological vision of power relations in the transformed state, especially with figures who moved among several spheres like Barcelonins Gaspar de Remisa or Erasme de Gónima. Cruz's individual cases, in fact, often suggest much more complexity than quantitative summaries evoke.

Finally, these analyses also raise questions of interdisciplinary dialogue with concerns of sociologists and anthropological historians. Terms like "random sampling," for example, have a much more concrete meaning than that which is used here. Social and cultural questions, while gamely tackled, are clearly appended rather than integrated—this is a book about men and business to which cultural features seem epiphenomenal. Women, in particular, are treated as secondary connections and mass consumers rather than agents who might have more complex roles to play in family, kinship, and the reproduction of social networks. In this regard, the absence of visual materials on life and style in the section on culture, which would bring its arguments to the level of complexity of chapters on economic and political networks, was striking. Nonetheless, Cruz's work should provide a strong foundation for scholars and debates to follow.

A final note must be made about the presentation of the book where responsibility presumably rests with the press and editor as well as the author. In such a worthwhile book, it is disturbing to see continuous flaws in writing and editing. These go beyond omissions in the bibliography; irritating errors in grammar, spelling, and accent crop up far too frequently. This editorial failing mars the reading of the book, especially since the volume demands and deserves careful attention to appreciate its data and the arguments constructed thereon.

GARY W. McDONOGH
Bryn Mawr College

CHRISTIAN WINDLER. *Élites locales, señores, reformistas: Redes clientelares y Monarquía hacia finales del Antiguo Régimen*. Translated by ANTONIO SÁEZ ARANCE. (Historia y Geografía, number 18.) Seville: Universidad de Sevilla; in association with Universidad de Córdoba. 1997. Pp. 524.

This book, originally published in German, now is available in Spanish, the language of the country it studies. Christian Windler focuses on the eighteenth and early nineteenth-century strengthening of local elites, crucial in the improvement of agriculture (grain

production in particular), as population nearly trebled in Spain during the eighteenth century. Hunger was a very real problem throughout the period.

By the first half of the nineteenth century, the losers in this process—primarily the nobles, church, and monarchy—witnessed the abolition of mortmain (laws preserving church property) and the imposition of *desamortación* (disentailment of civil property) in the relatively famous Constitution of Cádiz of 1812 and later in the more mundane but longer-lasting Constitution of 1837.

In this process, middle-class control hardened after a shaky beginning that saw the mid-nineteenth-century liberal governments suffer a series of setbacks and embarrassments. In the Constitution of 1876, Antonio Cánovas del Castillo finally shifted significant political functions to a highly centralized government, while making sure that the elites who controlled the local *municipios* worked in concert with the central government in Madrid.

Politicians were encouraged (or followed their natural avarice) to develop a clientele from extended family ties in the system called *caciquismo*. The word *cacique* originally came from the Arawak word for chief, brought back to Spain early in the encounter with indigenous Americans. First applied to royal tax-collectors, it evolved into the local Spanish label for "political boss." After all, boss-style politics made sense in a society struggling to change its rural conditions. Like American urban political machines, this approach mediated change to an untutored populace.

The process of change, Windler points out, began in the late eighteenth century. Strong ducal administration by the Medinacelis, Medina Sidonia, and others improved local administration by sending technically trained administrators to their lands. Economic societies in the era of the enlightened Carlos III improved the quality of *municipio* personnel and local elite expertise. The ideas of Bernardo Ward, Don Pedro Rodríguez Campomanes, and other early technocrats made a major impact and are made good use of in this monograph.

Southern Andalusia, the area of largest estates in Spain since the Reconquest gave Muslim property to the church and aristocracy, felt the impact of these changes the most, since northern Spain consists of small holdings and the central Castilian *meseta* is non-agricultural range land. Windler's research is best in discussing the Sociedad Económica organized in Seville in 1778, which tended to side with local citizens against nobles and Spaniards from other regions or to assist its members and friends to acquire property at the expense of the state or church. One can fast forward from here to Cánovas's *caciquismo*.

What is new is Windler's discussion of "social communication," a concept previously unknown to me. The quality of the book exists in its last hundred pages and in its survey of European scholarship on the changes caused by enlightened despotism. Ernst Mannheim and Jürgen Habermas have used the term "social