

1994

Review of *Izzy: A Biography of I. F. Stone*, by Robert C. Cottrell

Elliott Shore

Bryn Mawr College, eshore@brynmawr.edu

[Let us know how access to this document benefits you.](#)

Follow this and additional works at: http://repository.brynmawr.edu/history_pubs

 Part of the [History Commons](#)

Custom Citation

Shore, Elliott. Review of *Izzy: A Biography of I. F. Stone*, by Robert C. Cottrell. *American Historical Review* 99 (1994): 683.

This paper is posted at Scholarship, Research, and Creative Work at Bryn Mawr College. http://repository.brynmawr.edu/history_pubs/10

For more information, please contact repository@brynmawr.edu.

GIs returning from the most brutal fighting, and their elimination of traditional elements of Japanese culture.

Martial law ruled Hawaii for most of the war, and the authors demonstrate how federal power sometimes abetted people pushing against the boundaries of difference and prejudice. For example, the military refused to let prostitutes hike prices to five dollars, but it supported them against local efforts to confine their living quarters to the red-light district. Military authorities also backed African-American servicemen who insisted on their right to be saluted by lower-ranking whites, refused to doff hats for southern officers, or relied on self-defense against flagrant racism. The wartime influx of people from the mainland brought more blatant racism to Hawaii, but the war also fostered black resistance: Hawaii's first NAACP branch was formed in 1944, largely by servicemen.

The qualitative nature of their research and the complexity and variety of human relationships across race, ethnic, and gender lines prevent the authors from making broad generalizations. Nor do they go beyond V-J day to draw conclusions about the lasting impact of the war on Hawaii's social fabric or on the people who passed through. Although not a definitive history of wartime Hawaii, this study adds remarkably to our understanding of World War II and of multicultural relations, while its witty and moving prose makes it a delight to read.

SUSAN M. HARTMANN
Ohio State University,
Columbus

ROBERT C. COTTRELL. *Izzy: A Biography of I. F. Stone*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press. 1992. Pp. xii, 388. \$25.95.

Robert C. Cottrell's reworking of his dissertation, "Wielding the Pen as a Sword: The Radical Journalist, I. F. Stone" (1983)—to which the author refers neither in the introduction, bibliography, nor anywhere else—tells the story of a journalist who made his most distinctive mark as the editor and publisher of his own newsletter, the *I. F. Stone Weekly*, from 1953 to 1971. The strengths of the book are the result of extensive interviews that Cottrell conducted with Stone and Stone's friends and family, and the thoroughness of his reading of Stone's reports, essays, and books. Cottrell provides a reliable guide to Stone's long career as a journalist and Washington correspondent for major East Coast newspapers, chiefly in Philadelphia and New York, and his complex relationships with communism (particularly with the American Communist Party), Palestine, Zionism, and Israel. He delineates Stone's unchanging commitment to finding a socialism that could function within a democratic context, and his exasperated but always passionate love of the United States. Cottrell is

at his finest when he handles that period of Stone's life that is best known, that of the *Weekly*, when Stone's voice in the wilderness stood as a beacon for many of those who despaired of the possibility of a progressive politics in Cold War and McCarthyite America, and which provided a crucial link for the members of the Students for a Democratic Society in the 1960s to an older Left politics.

Unfortunately, Cottrell's narrow focus on the activities of his hero severely limit the book's utility as a work of history, for Cottrell fails to make even a perfunctory attempt to place Stone in some larger historical context. One looks in vain for a discussion of Stone's relation to the history of journalism, especially radical journalism, or to the history of American socialism or to American social or intellectual history, or even to Stone's own social background, growing up as a Jew in the Philadelphia area in the first quarter of the twentieth century. When he ventures out of the strictly Stone-based material, Cottrell makes errors of fact and interpretation. Often his attempts at placing Stone in context are limited to lists of Stone's friends and colleagues. One wonders about the presumed audience for the book: confronted with long lists of unidentified persons, is one to assume that all readers will be able to make the connection between them and Stone? Because Cottrell avoids analysis, he fails to ask several obvious if difficult questions: what might it mean that Stone was most effective when progressive politics seemed to be at their weakest? Why did Stone become a "celebrated" American, and what relationship did it have to the decline in the importance of the written word and the rise of television? How can one connect Stone as successful businessman and traditional family man with the radical journalism that he practiced and the calls he made for radical social change? The thoroughness that Cottrell applied to reading the work of Stone is sadly not matched with a scholarly assessment of Stone's place in American history.

ELLIOTT SHORE
Institute for Advanced Study
Princeton, New Jersey

GEORGE F. HOFMANN. *Cold War Casualty: The Court-Martial of Major General Robert W. Grow*. Kent, Ohio: Kent State University Press. 1993. Pp. xiii, 251. \$26.00.

One of the most chilling features of America's Cold War paranoia was the almost random way in which the internal security state selected its victims. They were not all former communists and political dissidents, or even labor leaders and liberal intellectuals. Robert W. Grow may have been the most unlikely security risk of all. During World War II, Grow commanded the Sixth Armored Division in George S. Patton's Third Army. After effective service as the American military attaché in postwar Iran, Grow was assigned to the U.S. embassy in Moscow. As did many